First-generation college students (FGCS) typically have difficulty adjusting to college compared to continuing-generation college students (CGCS). Previous research has found that FGCS are less engaged in their higher education classes. However, engagement in college should also include participation in extracurricular activities, as they can be a source of acceptance for students. The current study determined whether FGCS report different kinds and levels of experiences regarding engagement in their college classes and extracurricular activities compared to their CGCS peers, and whether the experiences identify problems that FGCS are more likely to face. Two hundred forty-eight undergraduate students (58 male, 176 female) in the University of Utah Psychology Department’s participant pool participated. Of these, 97 identified as FGCS and 135 identified as CGCS. An online survey was sent to students to test the hypothesis that FGCS is associated with lower involvement in extracurricular activities; lower affective, behavioral, and agentic engagement in their classes; and higher disengagement in their classes. It was predicted that these variables would predict students’ outcomes (belonging in college, personal power in college, felt authenticity, and self-esteem). The results did not support the hypotheses, as no differences between generational status in the measured variables were found. However, independent of generational status, affective engagement was positively correlated with all four outcomes. Finally, self-esteem was significantly correlated with all four types of engagement. The findings suggest that professors in college should ensure their classes are engaging and interactive for students, so that all students, regardless of first-generation status, can succeed in higher education.